

March 20, 1952

Dear Tom:

I'm sorry to have taken so long with your ms., but I had too many things of the same kind waiting for me to be able to get to it sooner. I have not given it so detailed a raking-over, because I thought that you could do the same yourself. Frankly, it reads as if it were rather heavily padded. I would think that the most appropriate form for such a contribution would be to subjoin the general results of the genetic analysis and put the two together as a note in Archives of Biochem. The mutation is certainly interesting from a chemical-genetic standpoint, but until the details of malate and succinate utilization are unravelled it is more an advertisement of something interesting to come, rather than a fully rounded accomplishment. I have a few specific notes, marked in red on the margins:

1. A little more needs to be said about the origin of your s- K-12. I don't think that our stock is s-, but am enclosing it for your inspection and comparison. If this is right, you should refer to s- as a mutant substrain of questionable origin, and the emphasis of identification falls to the s-. In view of our routine use of EMS medium, this question of the character of our standard K-12 stocks is bound to recur if not made clear at the outset.
2. "classical coliforma" is what?! You don't really have to be so cagey about contamination (in print). The evidence can be there without being overemphasized. Table II is superfluous, conclusions are sufficient.
3. refer to T-S mutant only if s- K-12 is described as a mutant.
4. See 8
5. Was limiting factor simply scope of these experiments? What are details of original isolation of s₀+? Could s₀+ be simply a residual original K-12?
6. See enclosed reprint. (By the way, let me know which papers of mine you have, so I can bring my distribution file up to date. Thanks.)
7. I don't see the point of dragging in the kinetics figures in this paper. Why not cite Nelson 1951, and mention agreement.
8. That's the rub.
9. The genetics should come here too.

Sincerely,

Joshua Lederberg